

From Cochise to Geronimo: The Chiricahua Apaches, 1874–1886 (review)

Janne Lahti

Southwestern Historical Quarterly, Volume 115, Number 3, January 2012, pp. 315-316 (Review)



Published by Texas State Historical Association *DOI:* https://doi.org/10.1353/swh.2012.0016

→ For additional information about this article

https://muse.jhu.edu/article/462377

name, among which Reid's novel might get lost. This would be a shame. After reading *Comanche Sundown*, one hopes that there is much more in store from this Texas author of considerable talent.

www.texashistory.com

GLEN SAMPLE ELY

From Cochise to Geronimo: The Chiricahua Apaches, 1874–1886. By Edwin R. Sweeney. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2010. Pp. 640. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. ISBN 9780806141503, \$39.95 cloth.)

In his latest book, Edwin R. Sweeney, an authority on Apache history, takes the reader once more to the deserts and mountains of the Southwest borderlands. This time he has tackled what is arguably one of the most captivating episodes in the history of U.S.-indigenous conflicts, the last Apache Wars. Chronologically organized, the chapters start with the last years and death of the influential Chiricahua leader Cochise and end with the famous surrender of Geronimo and the forced removal of all Chiricahuas to Florida as prisoners of war in 1886. The epilogue briefly describes the further sufferings of the imprisoned Chiricahuas. In all, this is a story of conquest, resistance, and survival. The Chiricahuas lost their homelands and approximately half of their population in a matter of few years after the federal government's concentration policy in the mid-1870s forced them to the hated San Carlos, to which many refused to go and others declined to stay. Together with the long-lasting conflict between the Chiricahuas and Mexicans, Apache suspicions towards Anglos born from past wrongs, and white racial prejudice, this disastrous policy—and subsequent government inflexibility—fuelled a cycle of violence. The Southwest witnessed a series of Apache outbreaks, raiding, U.S. offensives —including the army's invasion into the Sierra Madre Mountains in Mexico in 1883—and often failed Chiricahua attempts at reservation life.

This book is clearly a sequel to Sweeney's previous works *Cochise: Chiricahua Apache Chie*f (University of Oklahoma Press, 1991) and *Mangas Coloradas: Chief of the Chiricahua Apaches* (University of Oklahoma Press, 1998). Taken together, Sweeney's trilogy constitutes a first-class political and military history of the Chiricahua Apaches and their conflicts with Mexico and the United States during the nineteenth century. Much like in his earlier studies, Sweeney again delivers a skilful narrative filled with details and based on thorough knowledge of archival sources. The author has combed through an impressive stack of original sources, including oral materials, government documents, and manuscript collections from numerous archives.

Although the writing is often passionate and fluent, and the author's command of his subject is apparent on every page, the book is not without its problems. For one, the text, at 581 pages, could have benefited from some trimming. On one hand, so many pages bring value to the book as the author has been able to dig deep into his topic; to show how complex sequences of events unfolded and to uncover the choices of different players (civilian agents, military men, Apache leaders). On the other hand, the habit of describing how events unfolded and what people did on a day-to-day basis can make for an engaging story, but too many unnecessary details can confuse the casual reader and leave the academic reader yearning for more analysis. While the author's focus is very thorough, it is

also unfortunately rather narrow. There is little effort to connect the U.S./Mexico-Chiricahua wars to their global context, meaning other colonial conflicts around the world, or to explain local social and political developments in the border-lands between 1874 and 1886. The railroads, the Tombstone mining boom, and the rapid expansion of cattle ranching on Arizona ranges connected the area to the industrialized global market economy and had multiple impacts on the U.S.-Chiricahua wars.

Despite its shortcomings, this book is a must for anyone interested in Apache history, the frontier army, U.S.-indigenous wars, and the history of the Southwest. It is most appealing to those who like their history chronologically organized, action-packed, detailed, and filled with interesting characters.

Espoo, Finland Janne Lahti

Life at the Kiowa, Comanche, and Wichita Agency: The Photographs of Annette Ross Hume. By Kristina L. Southwell and John R. Lovett. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2010. Pp. 254. Black and white photographs, notes, bibliography, index. ISBN 9780806141381 \$34.95 cloth.)

Kristina L. Southwell and John R. Lovett have dug deep into the bowels of the Western History Collections at the University of Oklahoma in order to reproduce a major part of the photographic collection of Annette Hume. It is a collection with no parallel, at least in Oklahoma, and provides a wonderful glimpse into the lives of primarily Native peoples just before and after the turn of the nineteenth century. The photos and the collection, virtually unknown to historians, were brought to the university by Edward Everett Dale in the 1920s after the several years it took him to raise enough money to purchase them. The original collection consists of 738 images, of which Southwell and Lovett have reproduced 138.

Annette Ross Hume came to Oklahoma in 1889, joining her husband in the first Oklahoma land run. Making a land claim, and a medicine practice, Charles Hume was soon thereafter appointed medical doctor to all the reservation Indians in western Oklahoma, in particular the Comanche and Kiowa. This necessitated a move to Anadarko, the first town of any significance in that part of the territory. Annette purchased a commercially available camera package within a year and began to record daily life in and about Anadarko. Taking photos in that day and age was physically challenging, as it required the lifting of heavy glass plates. But successive improvements—most importantly the invention of the dry plate negative—occurred just as Annette Hume began her passion. Hume took photos for the next twenty years, doing many outside pieces that captured the essence of Indian life.

The quality of the photos included in the collection varies, and one suspects that many of those that were rejected for publication were likely difficult to reproduce. Some staged portraits of individual Indians, babies in cradles, etc., are much clearer than those taken outside. To conceive of the value of the collection today, however, consider that just one dry plate has recently sold at auction for nearly \$400.

What gives the collection such value are the subjects. Photos of Kiowa and Comanche council meetings are classic, as are the many Indian children who